SADC REGIONAL PROGRAMME FOR RHINO CONSERVATION

MEETINGS OF SADC RHINO RANGE STATES AND RHINO RECOVERY GROUP

KILAGUNI, KENYA 6-11 JUNE, 2004

PROCEEDINGS















PROJECT KEY DATA

Project title: SADC Regional Programme for Rhino

Conservation

ID N. AID 5064

Donor: Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs

(MAAEE)

Directorate General for Development

Cooperation

Executing agency: CESVI Cooperazione e Sviluppo

Regional implementing

consortium:

Consortium including:

CESVI

SADC Wildlife Sector Technical

Coordination Unit

IUCN - The World Conservation Union -

Regional Office for Southern Africa

IUCN African Rhino Specialist Group

WWF - World Wide Fund for Nature Southern African Regional Programme

Office

MAAEE/DGCS Contract: Convenzione rep. N. 975 del 25.10.1996

Reference agreement: Technical Framework for the SADC Rhino

Programme signed by consortium members,

SADC Secretariat and MAAEE/DGCS.

Starting date: 24 September 1999

End date: extension to 31 December 2004 requested

RECORD OF SADC RHINO RANGE STATES WORKSHOP

Kilaguni Lodge, Tsavo West National Park, Kenya 6-11 June 2004

PARTICIPANTS

Range States Representatives

- P. du Preez (Namibia)
- M. Knight (South Africa)
- B. Kumchedwa (Malawi)
- F. Langa (Mozambique)
- H. Madzikanda (Zimbabwe)
- H. Magome (South Africa)
- M. and T. Reilly (Swaziland)
- J. Sewagodimo (Botswana)
- C. Taolo (Botswana)

Representatives of Implementing Consortium

- R. Brett (outgoing Programme Coordinator)
- M. Brooks (IUCN/SSC African Rhino Specialist Group)
- G. Daconto (CESVI)
- R. du Toit (WWF-SARPO)
- R. Emslie (IUCN/SSC African Rhino Specialist Group)
- F. Mkanda (IUCN-ROSA)
- L. Mungwashu (Rhino & Elephant Security Group)

Italian Government Representative

A. Guillet (MAE-DGCS)

1. REVIEW OF SADC RPRC ACTIVITIES

The outgoing Programme Coordinator, Dr. R. Brett, reviewed the activities undertaken within the programme to date, as follows.

The SADC RPRC aims to provide expertise, specialized logistical support, training, information and catalytic funding in support of SADC regional conservation projects and policies for rhinos as flagship species. This can be achieved by:

- Maximizing population growth rates, enhancing overall biodiversity, ensuring economic sustainability, and stimulating local community conservation awareness and involvement in the protection and wise use of these species.
- Establishing regional co-ordination in the management of rhino species, creating a
 precedent within SADC so that this co-ordination can be extended to other wildlife species
 that should be managed at a regional rather than at a local level.

Since inception in late 1999, the programme has supported a number of projects of a regional nature and application, using the following broad conditions for allocation of funding:

• Projects must be of a SADC regional nature or importance

- Projects must limited to 'subspecies' Ceratotherium simum simum, Diceros bicornis minor and D.b.bicornis.
- Fundamental rhino management issues such as land use economics, community involvement, etc. must be taken into account
- Both public and private rhino conservation projects will be considered
- Implementation must make use of existing institutions and linkages

Projects which have been supported since the last AfRSG meeting (Malilangwe 2002) are listed below, and are grouped according to the main outputs of the programme.

1.1 Institutional arrangements

Zambia - Rhino Conservation Strategy: Workshop facilitated and Strategy drafted + technical input (July 2003)

Mozambique & Angola - Guidelines and/or Draft Rhino Conservation Policy Drafted (March 2004)

Rhino Management Group of Southern Africa (RMG) - Meeting convened (Namibia: June 2003)

SADC Rhino Recovery Group (RRG) and Range States Meetings convened (Botswana: March 2003)

Regional Coordination on provision of rhinos for reintroduction projects (e.g. Botswana, South Africa, Zambia, Zimbabwe, US Zoos)

1.2 Reporting systems and surveys

Regional - WILDb rhino population and monitoring database developed and tested in Zimbabwe, and installed in South Africa and other range states (Site version 1.41, National version 1.01) and module (WILDxI) to generate RMG population performance indicators, including export to RHINO 2.0. Namibia national database to use modified and enhanced WILDb.

Regional - Improving security and management of rhino horn stocks in SADC rhino range states (TRAFFIC): Rhino Horn and Product Database (RHPD), Rhino Horn Seizure Database (RHSD), Wildlife Stockpile Register Database (RSRD: Rhino Horns)

Regional - Law Database v 1.0, including pilot testing in South Africa and training by RESG consultants (2003-2004)

1.3 Technical capacity and training

Zimbabwe - Training courses for NPWLMA scouts in rhino monitoring techniques (October 2002, October-November 2003)

Regional - Training courses for Regional instructors in rhino monitoring techniques (July 2003 & March-April 2003)

Namibia - Capacity Building for Rhino Monitoring: Training Needs Assessment for MET field staff (January-February 2003)

Regional - Development of Guidelines for Rhino Reintroduction Projects

Regional - Training courses in Scene-of-Crime investigation (Namibia: May 2003; Zimbabwe August 2003; Swaziland: December 2003; Botswana March 2004)

South Africa, Zambia - Translocation of founder group of black rhinos from South Africa to Zambia (North Luangwa NP) (May 2003), and follow up technical support on post-release monitoring

Namibia, South Africa, Botswana - Translocation of four black rhinos from Namibia to South Africa, and South Africa to Botswana (November 2003)

South Africa & Namibia - Exchange of white rhinos from RSA for black rhinos from Swaziland (March 2004)

Namibia - Trial of rhino release and establishment procedures in arid zones: portable release boma (March 2004)

1.4 Community participation

Namibia - Study of Biological and Human factors limiting West Kunene black rhino population (2003)

Namibia - Stakeholder workshop on biological management goals for black rhino in North West Namibia (March 2004)

Zimbabwe & Swaziland- Creating Awareness of rhino conservation in rural primary schools: The Rhino Cards (2003-2004)

Zimbabwe - Creating Awareness of rhino conservation in rural secondary schools (March 2004 on)

Regional - Economic analysis of rhino conservation for land use in SADC Region (underway)

1.5 Provision of expertise from SADC Region: Evaluations and assessments

Swaziland - Expert assessment of black rhino carrying capacity in two rhino reserves (April 2002)

Review of Rhino Reintroductions to Mombo Medium-Density Tourist Zone, Chief's Island, Moremi GR (July 2003)

Technical support for post-release monitoring of black rhino in North Luangwa NP (June 2003)

Appraisal of the potential for rhino conservation in Mozambique (March 2003)

1.6 Tools and technology for rhino conservation

Regional - RHINO 2.0 population estimation software development, and user training in South Africa (March 2004)

Regional - Improving SADC RMG Black Rhino Carrying Capacity Model, including Review and Standardised Browse Availability assessment

Regional - Rhino horn finger-printing: development and validation of techniques

Zimbabwe - New technology for rhino monitoring and patrol reporting: Scout Tracker GPS datalogging device.

1.7 Overall

The programme has provided its most effective support to individual range states through sequential inputs addressing many essential ingredients of a national rhino conservation programme. Support for Botswana is an example where a series of projects implemented between 2001-2004 have steadily developed the country rhino programme from strategic planning to rhino reintroduction.

2. DRAFT REGIONAL STRATEGY FOR RHINO CONSERVATION

The draft regional strategy, dated 10 June 2004, was reviewed. This draft had had previously been circulated to focal points within the range states and to representatives of the implementing consortium. After presentation by the Technical Coordinator (R. du Toit), the following comments arose from the participants in this session.

2.1 Goal and Objective

Consensus arose that neither of the alternative drafts of the goal were ideal and the goal must be redrafted.

Dr. T. Teferi noted the need to include reference to the development-related objectives of SADC, showing how these objectives might be linked to the creation of viable rhino metapopulations.

Dr. M. Brooks suggested that the goal should encompass a more tangible end-point, rather than just stating a general need for cooperation in rhino conservation, etc.

Dr. R. Emslie felt that a demographic target (population growth rate) should be expressed in the goal and/or objective.

2.2. Regional Context

The participants generally felt that a brief explanation is required of the rationale for a strategy for rhino conservation in SADC Region. References to SADC agreements and documents are required.

2. 3. Guiding Principles

2.3.1 Rhino Taxa

Dr. M. Knight highlighted the importance of the SADC RPRC in influencing range states to think regionally in management of subspecies.

Two main views emerged on the question of which rhino sub-species should be included in a regional strategy. One view was that only sub-species that are managed as metapopulations across the borders of SADC countries should be included. This would mean that the northern white rhino (*C.s.cottoni*) would be excluded because it occurs only in DRC and has no regional management, and the eastern black rhino in northern Tanzania (*D.b.michaeli*) would be excluded because its historical range does not overlap with any other SADC countries and therefore this species is better managed in a regional metapopulation that includes Kenya and other eastern African countries. The other view was that these subspecies are all biodiversity assets of the SADC region that warrant regional inputs. The consensus was to include all taxa, but with caveats for *D.b.michaeli* and *C.s.cottoni*, and with emphasis on stimulating an equivalent metapopulation approach for Eastern Africa. Maps should be produced to show current and historical range of taxa. Recent genetics research could be cited to support the validity of the four black rhino subspecies that are currently recognized by AfRSG.

Dr. M. Knight noted that Thaba Tholo (a private property in South Africa with an out-of-range group of *D.b.michaeli*) is a good source population for restocking East African areas, e.g. Rwanda, Tanzania.

Mr. L. Mungwashu felt that incorporating DRC and emphasizing regional metapopulation management may stimulate DRC to agree to translocate some threatened northern white rhinos to a more secure SADC country.

Dr. Martin Brooks said that the SADC RPRC implementation efforts will be undertaken in accordance with the regional strategy but need not necessarily all elements of the strategy.

2.3.2 Priority Areas

The following points were agreed:

- Change section to become priority criteria for selection, and omit details of areas currently prioritised;
- Include criteria such as an area being the only historical range for a subspecies, and expansion potential;
- Emphasize importance of TFCAs;
- Use AfRSG delimitation of historical species ranges as a guide, but each state could make strong arguments to define different current ranges.

It was felt to be important to stress an adaptive approach to setting goals for subspecies numbers.

2.3.3 Re-introduction Guidelines

It was agreed to present one set of guidelines only, that absorbed the guidelines of the IUCN Re-Introduction Specialist Group.

2.3.4 Strategic objectives

It was agreed to stress the desirability of consistency of focal points. Dr. A. Guillet suggested that a mechanism should be specified for appointment of focal points through SADC Secretariat. Some countries have more than one rhino management authority (e.g. South Africa and Tanzania). The meaning of "metapopulation management" must be clearly defined.

For capacity-building, Dr. A. Guillet felt that it is important to highlight the need the maintain and enhance institutional capacity not only for rhino management as such, but also for the use of training tools developed under the SADC RPRC which may require more general training capacity. Mr. R. du Toit suggested that the CITES resolution that requires reporting by all rhino range states could best be coordinated under the SADC RPRC via the SADC Secretariat, but Dr. M. Brooks felt that this was too specific as an objective of the SADC RPRC and such reporting should be referred to in a more generic way.

The meeting felt that specific detail on regional organisations should be removed and this section should be simplified to explain how technical support and donor support link through AfRSG, etc. The terms of reference of RESG should be given in an annex.

2.4 Next steps

Ongoing refinement of the draft regional strategy by the Technical Coordinator (R. du Toit) for review by the Implementing Consortium in September 2004 and presentation to Range States via focal points for endorsement (by directors of management authorities) prior to final endorsement by SADC Secretariat.

3. REVIEW OF OPTIONS FOR PHASE 2 OF SADC RPRC

A draft outline proposal for Phase 2 of the RPRC was presented by the Technical Coordinator (R. du Toit) and the following points arose from the discussion on this.

New criteria for phase II projects:

- Show potential for long term viability;
- Meet SADC developmental criteria;
- Meet policy recommendations from international fora (e.g. World Parks Congress);
- Draw in support from other agencies or regional initiatives (e.g. TFCAs);
- Help develop models for sound governance of rhino conservation areas;
- Explore innovative approaches to conservation funding;
- For re-introductions, AfRSG "best practice" must be followed.

The need for new models for community participation/ownership of rhino projects (or even of rhinos themselves) was agreed to by the meeting.

Mr. R. du Toit suggested that instead of having a single coordinator, thematic coordinators could be identified (within existing institutions?) to develop and supervise tasks relating to those theses (programme outputs). This suggestion received some support, with Dr. A. Guillet mentioning the identification of "centres of excellence" to implement the Italian-funded SABONET programme.

The Chairman of the RESG, Mr. L. Mungwashu, endorsed the suggestion that the RESG be henceforth subsumed within the SADC RPRC and this was agreed to by the meeting.

Options for next steps were summarized as:

- 1. do not continue with the SADC RPRC beyond Phase 1;
- 2. explicitly request further donor support from Italian Government;
- 3. develop a broader programme involving other donors.

It was agreed that a combination of 2. and 3. would be feasible.

It was agreed to keep these options open while ongoing refinement of the draft proposal is undertaken by the Technical Coordinator (R. du Toit) for review by the Implementing Consortium in September 2004 and presentation to Range States focal points.

4. RANGE STATES REVIEW OF SADC RPRC

In order that the donor representative (Dr. A. Guillet) could receive feedback on how the programme is perceived, the Range States focal points held a closed discussion (i.e. without representatives of the implementing consortium) to develop consensus on this issue. This session was chaired by Dr. M. Knight, who led the participants through a review of the following questions:

- Has the RPRC met expectations, to date?
- What concerns regarding the RPRC have arisen within Range States?
- What recommendations can be made, taking any concerns into account?

Range States responses, summarized by Dr. M. Knight, were as follows.

Namibia – has seen the greatest impact of RPRC in capacity-building and is satisfied with the forms of support that have been provided but concerns arise over the sustainability of training programmes.

Malawi – the only SADC RPRC input has been at Liwonde, and more input is needed (feedback was not received on one proposal to SADC RPRC).

Botswana – has experienced significant degree of interaction with the SADC RPRC particularly regarding advisory missions related to rhino re-introductions at Mombo. No major concerns have arisen, but sustainability is a concern.

Swaziland – SADC RPRC inputs have been scene-of-crime training, habitat assessment, schools awareness, regional rhino translocations and no major concerns have arisen.

Zimbabwe – has benefited from provision of equipment, scene-of-crime training, software, attendance at meetings, but sees a lack of attention to community involvement being a weakness of SADC RPRC.

South Africa – has appreciated facilitation of regional translocations of rhinos, development of biological management guidelines and provision of training programme.

The general feedback was seen as being very positive, with the proof of a worthwhile programme being shown in the regional translocations of rhinos.

For a Phase 2, the Range States representatives felt that the following issues are important:

- More effort on education/awareness;
- Continuity of capacity building must be maintained: SADC RPRC training modules must be cemented into regional institutions;
- The next phase must show more inclusivity: include DRC;
- Security issues should be considered more: need to bring in RESG;
- Recent experiences in creating new populations must be captured as "lessons learned";
- More holistic regional integration is needed: e.g. involving veterinary and agricultural sectors.

The Italian Government representative, Dr. A. Guillet, stated that he was pleased to be able to take this feedback from Range States as being a positive vote for continuation of the SADC RPRC. He emphasized that any new phase would have to be viewed as an overall regional programme rather than a country-by-country programme and some areas would inevitably receive more attention than others in terms of regional, rather than national, priorities. He also stressed the need to deal more with social and economic aspects and to maximize synergy with other regional initiatives such as TFCAs.

5. RHINO AND ELEPHANT SECURITY GROUP

The RESG Chairman, Mr. L. Mungwashu, presented the following report.

Delegates will recall that at the last AfRSG meeting held at Malilangwe in Zimbabwe the RESG had just finished reviewing the RESG TERMS OF REFERENCE to guide the operations of the organisation. The terms of reference were submitted to CEOs of the various participating Wildlife Conservation Agencies for approval and I am glad to say they were approved by the majority of these Wildlife Agencies. After securing approval, RESG started implementing the key components of the TERMS OF REFERENCE which, as you recall, were as follows:

Key components:

- Law enforcement
- " Intelligence
- " Procedures for effective investigation, prosecution and eradication of illegal trade.
- " Securing and managing rhino horn/ivory stocks.
- " Co-ordinating, networking and information exchange.
- " Training for capacity building.

- " Positive public involvement, awareness and education.
- " International and regional communications.
- " Sustainability, functioning and support of RESG.
- " Security.
- " Community involvement

Pursuant to the guidelines set out in the Terms of Reference some initiatives have been put in place to put into effect these key components.

5.1 Training for capacity building

Through funding provided by the SADC Regional Programme for Rhino Conservation a manual for training anti-poaching personnel on how to gather evidence at a Scene of Crime was developed. The production of the manual was followed by actual training of candidates identified by Wildlife Agencies. The training has not been restricted to just to Wildlife Agencies anti-poaching personnel but has included personnel from other law-enforcement agencies like the Police etc. These training courses have been well received by the participants and I have no doubt enhanced the ability of the trainees in carrying out their work. We continue to receive request for more courses to be held.

To date the following courses have been held:-

- Namibia: May 2003

Kenya: August 2003

- Zimbabwe: September 2004

- Botswana: March 2004.

Total number of personnel trained so far is one hundred. Future courses planned are:

South Africa: 28 June - 2 July 2004

Tanzania: 13 September 2004

Zambia: 15 November - 19 November 2004.

As indicated the response to these courses have been pleasing and we are overwhelmed by requests for additional courses to be run. We hope that we will get a donor who is willing to fund additional courses in 2005.

5.2 Implementation of regional and international conventions

In order to ensure that participating member Wildlife Agencies of RESG implement and adhere to the provisions of international and regional conventions the RESG has made sure that experts in the implementation in certain conventions are invited to give presentations during the regular meetings of the RESG.

To name but one event, Mr Simon Milledge of Traffic was invited to the RESG meeting held in Bloemfontein, South Africa, in October 2003 where he made presentations in the following areas:

- 1. CITES developments with respect to rhinos and elephants.
- 2. Rhino Horn Stockpile Management in SADC Region: Best Practices.
- 3. Wildlife Stockpile Register Database.

Dr Richard Emslie has made two presentations to update members on the Horn Fingerprinting Project.

5.3 Intelligence

This remains a major challenge as anti-poaching operatives are reluctant to pass on what they deem to be sensitive information for fear of it being compromised. However, with the kind permission of EKZN Wildlife, a Wildlife Rhino Data Base is being developed which will allow individual organisations to keep information relating to poaching in a systematic way. It is hoped, when completed and installed in the Wildlife Agencies, that the Wildlife Law Database is going to assist in maintaining information in the following areas.

- " Keep track of various items relevant to law enforcement.
- " Keep records of suspects and their associates
- " Businesses used as fronts.
- " Log and track incidents.
- " Track additional information.
- " Link a person to a business
- " List associated documents and their locations
- " Get information out of the database
- " List all items linked to a selected person.
- " Request incident statistics.
- " Graphs of standard reports based on selected parameters.
- " Cater for a large, widely-distributed organisation.
- " Have field databases feeding information into a central database.

5.4 Co-ordinating, networking and information exchange

Due to the international nature of wildlife crime, RESG continues to hold its meetings jointly with the Environmental Crime Task Group of Interpol. This has helped member organisations when they do not get the necessary support in following up cross-border cases.

5.5 Securing and managing rhino horn/ivory stocks

It is hoped, given the presentation that members got during the meeting in Bloemfontein, that members are able to make positive contributions to the management of rhino horn and ivory stockpiles in their respective countries.

6. RHINO RECOVERY GROUP MEETING

This meeting was held on 10 June 2004 at Kilaguni Lodge, Tsavo West NP

Present: Brighton Kumchedwa (Malawi - Chair)

Felismina Langa (Mozambique)

Cyril Taolo (Botswana)

Raoul du Toit (SADC RPRC/WWF) Francis Mkanda (SADC RPRC/IUCN) Martin Brooks (SADC RPRC/AfRSG) Alfredo Guillet (Italian Government)

Priscilla Mutikani (SADC RPRC/IUCN - in attendance)

Apologies: Tanzania (representative deceased, no replacement as yet)

Angola Zambia

6.1 Objectives

The objectives of the meeting were as follows:

- Assessment of progress since the last meeting;
- Selection of a new chair;
- · Setting of goals for the coming period; and
- Any other business

6.2 Progress

Countries represented at the meeting were asked to report on the progress since the last meeting. The participating countries reported as follows:

Mozambique

Raoul du Toit facilitated a workshop on the "Development of a Conservation Study". Proceedings were produced and will be circulated for comments. The Feasibility Study for Limpopo National Park was done and the document was circulated for comments. Follow up on the rhino presence in Niassa Game Reserve was not done due to the absence of guidelines.

Botswana

The National Rhino Management Strategy was adopted by the Department of National Parks and Wildlife. Ten (10) rhinos were translocated from South Africa to Botswana in October 2003 and released into the Mombo Game Reserve. One died before the release due to veterinary complications. The SADC Advisory Committee visited Botswana in 2003 to evaluate the security monitoring and biological arrangements at Mombo.

Malawi

The Management Plan for Liwonde National Park is ongoing. The first draft is almost ready and will be presented to stakeholders on July 7 for their input. There are no major activities in Liwonde except for rhino routine monitoring and ecosystems assessment on the sanctuary. Concerns were raised regarding the translocation of 2 rhinos from Liwonde to Majete as well as compartmentalization of animals in Liwonde NP. Mr. Kumchedwa advised that this was because of space constraints in the Liwonde Sanctuary. He however promised to advise the Director of the concerns raised. Mr. Kumchedwa was asked to find out about the objectives of African Parks (who did the translocation and subcontracted someone to do the snaring) and how they interact with African States. The need to come up with a proposal for the fencing of the entire Liwonde NP was discussed. An extension of the sanctuary within the Park subject to provision of additional land (Mangochi Forest Area) was also discussed. However, it was suggested that an alternative plan be mapped out in case the Mangochi Forest option failed.

The following was reported by Mr. du Toit on behalf of the countries that were not represented:

Angola

Mr. E. Chonguica of IUCN-ROSA and Dr. R. Brett of SADC RPRC had meetings with Angolan representatives to discuss policy formulation. Issues were tabled for discussion.

Tanzania

Tanzanian officials were taken to North Luangwa in Zambia for an exchange visit which they found to be valuable.

• Zambia

In situ training in rhino monitoring was provided in North Luangwa.

6.3 Selection of a new chair

The meeting was of the understanding that Botswana will assume chairmanship when the term of office expired for the current chair. It was decided that the Malawi government will send a letter to the Botswana government advising them of the chairmanship and also send any relevant documents. Since Mr. J. Chofota of WWF-SARPO was unavailable to assist, Dr. F. Mkanda of IUCN-ROSA was asked to monitor and coordinate the activities of the group with the assistance of the chair.

6.4 Goals for the next semester

The new chair was asked to contact other members, identify and prioritise activities for the coming year.

6.5 Any other business

The meeting was informed on the following:

- Mr. du Toit advised the meeting that training courses were held depending on individual needs of the countries. The chair should follow up with other Range States on their training needs.
- Dr. Brooks advised that it was agreed that the chair of the Rhino Recovery Group automatically becomes a member of the African Rhino Specialist Group.

- Mr. du Toit informed the meeting about the possibility of moving rhinos from South Africa to North Luangwa in Zambia. The SADC RPRC has money set aside to partly cover translocation costs. It was hoped that Botswana Defence Forces could assist with the air transportation because they have suitable cargo aircraft and are experienced in that field. This will in turn promote regional cooperation amongst the SADC countries.
- Translocation of Zimbabwean rhinos to Botswana is awaiting high level decision.
- Range states were urged to submit proposals in time for the next consortium meeting in September. Activities should be channeled through the chair.
- Dr. Guillet was impressed by the cooperation that is prevailing in the region. He urged members to train people who had no rhinos in their countries to prepare them for when they got rhinos in their countries.
- Through Mr. Kumchedwa, Dr. R. Bhima thanked all the members for the support provided to him when he was the chair and wished the new chair success.